

Thursday, December 07, 2017

Paul Tucker, P.E.
 Senior Utility Engineer
 City of McKinney, Texas
 221 N. Tennessee St.
 McKinney, TX 75070

Re: Recommendation of Award for Redbud Pump Station
 (FNI Project # MKN16362) CIP No. WA-8132, Bid No. 18-03RFCSP

Dear Mr. Tucker:

A total of six (6) bidders submitted competitive sealed proposals for the above referenced project on Friday, November 17, 2017. All six were accepted and their bid totals read aloud. Bids were for the construction and installation of a new Redbud Pump Station and associated yard piping, construction of a new 8.0 MG ground storage tank, and installation of 1250 kW and 50 kW generators.

The proposed contract price of each of the six bids received are summarized below. The prices shown below are the totals of Item A, Redbud Pump Station and 8.0 MG Ground Storage Tank, and Item B, NTMWD Meter and Flow Control Facility at McKinney No. 4. Item C, Additive Alternate Bid Items, was not considered when evaluating the proposals after discussion with City regarding the generator alternates. A bid tabulation is attached with this letter.

ITEMS A+B BID SUMMARY

	Garney Construction	Crescent Constructors, Inc.	Eagle Contracting, L.P.	Archer Western Construction LLC	Brunel	Cobra CYMI Industrial
Total Bid	\$23,154,100	\$23,263,000	\$23,397,000	\$23,616,700	\$23,987,864	\$25,139,000

The proposals were evaluated and scored based on three categories: proposed price (50 points), Contractor qualifications (25 points), and Contractor's project approach and schedule (25 points). Scoring was completed individually by the evaluation committee using the City's online Bonfire system. The total score for each proposal was then generated by the Bonfire system and provided by the City's Purchasing Department to the evaluation team. A summary of the total scores is below.

SCORING SUMMARY

	Garney Construction	Archer Western Construction LLC	Eagle Contracting, L.P.	Crescent Constructors Inc	Cobra CYMI Industrial	Brunel
Total Points	97.5	91.25	82.75	82.05	74.35	63.8

Redbud Pump Station

12/7/2017

Page 2 of 2

The evaluation showed Garney Construction as the highest scoring proposal with 97.5 points out of a possible 100. The project experience, key personnel, project schedule, and proposed project approach submitted by Garney Construction indicates that Garney Construction has experience with projects of similar scope and size and are highly qualified for the Redbud Pump Station project. Therefore, **FNI recommends the award of the project to Garney Construction in the amount of \$23,154,000.**

Please contact me with any questions or concerns you may have regarding this letter.

Sincerely,

Freese and Nichols, Inc.



Sam A. Meisner, P.E.

Project Manager

Attachments: Bid Tabulation

City of McKinney
 Redbud Pump Station, WA-8312, 18-03RFCSP
 MKN16362
 Bid Tabulation

ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	ESTIMATED QUANTITY	Crescent		Garney		Eagle	
				UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT
A									
Redbud Pump Station and 8.0 MG Ground Storage Tank									
1	For construction of the Redbud Pump Station Improvements complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 16,409,000.00	\$ 16,409,000.00	\$ 16,208,000.00	\$ 16,208,000.00	\$ 15,343,800.00	\$ 15,343,800.00
2	For construction of the 8.0 MG Ground Storage Tank complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications, including tank, structural excavation and backfill, foundation, inlet, outlet pipes, and appurtenances	LS	1	\$ 3,500,000.00	\$ 3,500,000.00	\$ 3,828,000.00	\$ 3,828,000.00	\$ 3,647,000.00	\$ 3,647,000.00
3	Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan	LS	1	\$ 2,900.00	\$ 2,900.00	\$ 21,000.00	\$ 21,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 15,000.00
4	Trench Safety Plan	LS	1	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00
5	Trench Safety (Bidder Estimates Quantity*)	LF	contractor	\$ 1.00	\$ 5,100.00	\$ 1.00	\$ 5,100.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 10,200.00
6	Extra Flexbase for Tank Foundation	CY	2000	\$ 50.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 74.00	\$ 148,000.00	\$ 67.00	\$ 134,000.00
7	Extra Flowable Fill	CY	500	\$ 150.00	\$ 75,000.00	\$ 116.00	\$ 58,000.00	\$ 130.00	\$ 65,000.00
8	Allowance for Contribution in Aid of Construction for Oncor Electric Service	LS	1	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00
9	Installation of One 1250 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 2 Emissions Standards, complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications.	LS	1	\$ 1,450,000.00	\$ 1,450,000.00	\$ 589,000.00	\$ 589,000.00	\$ 1,335,000.00	\$ 1,335,000.00
10	Installation of One 50 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 2 including pre-fabricated storm shelter enclosure, complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications.	LS	1	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 149,000.00	\$ 149,000.00	\$ 98,000.00	\$ 98,000.00
				SUBTOTAL A			\$ 21,177,100.00		\$ 20,823,000.00
B									
NTMWD Meter and Flow Control Facility at McKinney No. 4									
1	For construction of NTMWD Meter and Flow Control Facility complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 1,500,000.00	\$ 1,500,000.00	\$ 1,977,000.00	\$ 1,977,000.00	\$ 2,574,000.00	\$ 2,574,000.00
				SUBTOTAL B			\$ 1,977,000.00		\$ 2,574,000.00
				PROJECT TOTAL, BASE BID (A + B)			\$ 23,154,100.00		\$ 23,397,000.00
C									
Additive Alternate Bid Items									
1	Additive Alternate for installation of One 1250 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 4 Emissions Standards and all associated electrical upgrades complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 797,000.00	\$ 797,000.00	\$ 734,800.00	\$ 734,800.00
2	2-Year Service Agreement for Tier 2, 1250 kW Generator	LS	1	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	\$ 8,500.00	\$ 8,500.00
3	2-Year Service Agreement for Tier 4, 1250 kW Generator	LS	1	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 11,500.00	\$ 11,500.00
				SUBTOTAL C			\$ 818,000.00		\$ 754,800.00
				PROJECT TOTAL, BASE BID PLUS ADDITIVE ALTERNATE (A + B + C)			\$ 23,972,100.00		\$ 24,151,800.00

Legend

- Math Error
- Error completing Item A6 - Two bidders appeared to treat this as a lump sum. Have used their "lump sum" price for initial tabulation.

City of McKinney
 Redbud Pump Station, WA-8312, 18-03RFCSP
 MKN16362
 Bid Tabulation

ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	ESTIMATED QUANTITY	Archer Western		Brunel		COBRA		
				UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	EXTENDED AMOUNT	
A Redbud Pump Station and 8.0 MG Ground Storage Tank										
1	For construction of the Redbud Pump Station Improvements complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 15,316,000.00	\$ 15,316,000.00	\$ 14,698,614.00	\$ 14,698,614.00	\$ 16,900,000.00	\$ 16,900,000.00	
2	For construction of the 8.0 MG Ground Storage Tank complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications, including tank, structural excavation and backfill, foundation, inlet, outlet pipes, and appurtenances	LS	1	\$ 4,537,000.00	\$ 4,537,000.00	\$ 3,998,500.00	\$ 3,998,500.00	\$ 4,300,000.00	\$ 4,300,000.00	
3	Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan	LS	1	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 11,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 1,000.00	
4	Trench Safety Plan	LS	1	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 43,000.00	\$ 43,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	
5	Trench Safety (Bidder Estimates Quantity*)	LF	contractor	\$ 2.00	\$ 10,200.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 350,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	
6	Extra Flexbase for Tank Foundation	CY	2000	\$ 60.00	\$ 120,000.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 130,000.00	\$ 18.00	\$ 36,000.00	
7	Extra Flowable Fill	CY	500	\$ 35.00	\$ 17,500.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 27,500.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 60,000.00	
8	Allowance for Contribution in Aid of Construction for Oncor Electric Service	LS	1	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	\$ 170,000.00	
9	Installation of One 1250 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 2 Emissions Standards, complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications.	LS	1	\$ 1,447,000.00	\$ 1,447,000.00	\$ 640,000.00	\$ 640,000.00	\$ 600,000.00	\$ 600,000.00	
10	Installation of One 50 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 2 including pre-fabricated storm shelter enclosure, complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications.	LS	1	\$ 124,000.00	\$ 124,000.00	\$ 310,000.00	\$ 310,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	Engineer's OPCC
					\$ 21,754,700.00		\$ 20,617,614.00		\$ 22,139,000.00	\$ 22,700,300.00
B NTMWD Meter and Flow Control Facility at McKinney No. 4										
1	For construction of NTMWD Meter and Flow Control Facility complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 1,862,000.00	\$ 1,862,000.00	\$ 3,370,250.00	\$ 3,370,250.00	\$ 3,000,000.00	\$ 3,000,000.00	
					\$ 1,862,000.00		\$ 3,370,250.00		\$ 3,000,000.00	
PROJECT TOTAL					\$ 23,616,700.00		\$ 23,987,864.00		\$ 25,139,000.00	
C Additive Alternate Bid Items										
1	Additive Alternate for installation of One 1250 kW Generator meeting EPA Tier 4 Emissions Standards and all associated electrical upgrades complete and in place as shown in the plans and described in the specifications	LS	1	\$ 808,000.00	\$ 808,000.00	\$ 946,000.00	\$ 946,000.00	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,100,000.00	
2	2-Year Service Agreement for Tier 2, 1250 kW Generator	LS	1	\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 7,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	
3	2-Year Service Agreement for Tier 4, 1250 kW Generator	LS	1	\$ 11,200.00	\$ 11,200.00	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 9,500.00	\$ 9,500.00	
					\$ 827,600.00		\$ 946,000.00		\$ 1,116,500.00	
PROJECT TOTAL, BASE BID PLUS ADDITIVE					\$ 24,444,300.00		\$ 24,933,864.00		\$ 26,255,500.00	

Legend

- Math Error
- Error completing Item A6 - Two bidders appeared to treat this as a lump sum. Have used