

MINUTES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD MEETING

OCTOBER 7, 2010

The Historic Preservation Advisory Board (Board) met in regular session on Thursday, October 7, 2010, at 5:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers at City Hall.

Board Members present included Chairperson Brad McKissick, Vice Chairperson Susan Germann, Edna Brown, Randy Hubbard, Bill Kent, Bob Smith, and Kimberly Smith.

Staff Members present included Senior Planner Kevin Spath, Historic Preservation Officer Guy Giersch and Administrative Assistant Terri Ramey.

City Council Liaison Travis Ussery was present.

There were three guests present.

Mr. Giersch opened the meeting.

Mr. Giersch stated that the Board Members needed to elect a Chairperson and Vice Chairperson of the Historic Preservation Advisory Board. The Board Members made nominations, then voted by ballot, and elected Board Member Brad McKissick as Chairperson and elected Board Member Susan Germann as Vice Chairperson.

Chairperson Brad McKissick called the meeting to order and continued the agenda with the Consent Items.

On a motion by Board Member Bill Kent, seconded by Vice Chairperson Susan Germann, the Board voted 7-0 to approve the following Consent Item:

Consider the Minutes of the September 2, 2010 Historic Preservation Advisory Board Meeting.

On a motion by Board Member Randy Hubbard, seconded by Vice Chairperson Susan Germann, the Board voted 7-0 to approve the following Consent Item:

Consider the Quarterly Board and Commission Report for July – September 2010.

Chairperson Brad McKissick continued the agenda with the Public Hearing Item.

Conduct a Public Hearing to Consider/Discuss/Act on the Request by Mr. W. R. Livingston, Jr., for Approval

2010- 062H*
PH

**of a Certificate of Appropriateness to Remove Original
Wood Windows and Install Vinyl Replacement
Windows at 801 West Hunt Street.**

Mr. Guy Giersch explained the proposed Certification of Appropriateness application. He stated that Staff is not recommending approval of the applicant's request to remove the original wood windows and install vinyl replacement windows.

Mr. Giersch stated that Staff could recommend approval of retaining, repairing, and/or refinishing the existing original wood windows. Additionally, Staff could recommend approval of storm windows installed over the existing wood windows, since this method would preserve the historic wood windows while also providing the same or similar R-value as new replacement windows.

Mr. Giersch stated that Staff has discussed these options with the applicant; however, the applicant has not indicated interest in these options. He stated that it is also important to note that Staff's recommended options would likely qualify for the City of McKinney Historic Neighborhood Improvement Zone Tax Exemption Program; whereas, the applicant's proposal to remove the original wood windows and install vinyl replacement windows would likely not qualify for the tax exemption program.

Mr. Giersch stated that the applicant submitted a request for approval to remove the original wood windows and install vinyl replacement windows with vinyl grills/grids installed between two panes of glass. The applicant has stated that the proposed replacement windows would be similar in size to the original windows. The exterior and interior trims would be maintained as well.

Mr. Giersch stated that because these proposed changes would conflict with the principles established by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings, Staff is not able to recommend approval of the applicant's request.

Mr. Giersch stated that the Zoning Ordinance states that the Historic Preservation Officer (HPO) has approval authority over Certificate of Appropriateness Applications in the Commercial Historic District and the "H" Overlay District. The subject property is located in the "H" Overlay District. The Zoning Ordinance states that the HPO cannot deny a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) and must forward all COA's that he/she is not able to

approve to the HPAB for consideration and action. The applicant may request that the decision of the HPAB be forwarded to City Council for final consideration and action. To appeal HPAB's decision, the applicant must file a written application with the City Council through the Director of Planning within 21 days of receipt of the Board's written decision. The appeal application shall be set before the City Council at the first available City Council meeting.

Mr. Giersch stated that the style of these wood windows are 4/1 divided light windows. He stated that these are typical of the Arts & Craft style homes that are scattered throughout McKinney. He discussed the windows, Secretary of the Interior's Standards, Checklist of Design Elements, and Preservation Priority Rating. He stated that he believes if the application is approved, then what we begin to have is the deterioration of those characteristics of what makes the Historic District unique. He gave various examples of changes to properties that would affect the Historic District.

Mr. Giersch stated that research shows that if you replace every window in a house such as this with thermally "efficient" windows, they would pay for themselves in energy savings in 40 – 400 years, depending upon the cost of the replacement windows, utility costs, and the climate where you live. He stated that a vinyl window has a life expectancy of 10 – 20 years before you have to replace it. He stated that the wood windows in the house are already close to 100 years of age and felt that they could easily be restored. He stated that wood windows are forever repairable. He stated that with maintenance and the application of a storm window, these windows could be easily maintained and could provide the energy savings that the applicant is seeking.

Then, the applicant, Fred Livingston, 801 W. Hunt Street, McKinney, TX 75069, gave an overview of the request. He distributed copies of his comments to the Board. He stated that they had moved to McKinney in 1996 and leased a home on the west side of Central Expressway. He stated that they fell in love with the old area of town and searched for two years before finding the home on Hunt Street. He stated that his office was in the Ritz Building downtown when they first moved to McKinney.

Mr. Livingston stated that since then, they had worked diligently at restoring and rehabilitating the home on Hunt Street while trying to preserve its

original character and charm. He stated that they built a garage with a gravel driveway. He stated that they redid their front porch. He stated that their efforts were rewarded earlier this year when their home was one of five featured homes in the historical area of the McKinney Garden Club's Home and Garden Tour.

Mr. Livingston stated that they have both retired and, out of necessity, must start conserving more energy and money. He stated that at the top of the conservation list would be replacing the old, rotting, drafty windows of their home. He stated that the first winter they were in the home, that they found it necessary to caulk all of the windows to keep out the cold. He stated that this means that at this time of year, that they can not open a window to enjoy the cooler fall temperatures. He stated that if they should have a fire, they would have to break out a window to escape, should they not be able to get to a door. He stated that cooler temperatures also bring on the additional problem of condensation on the inside of the windows. He stated that this moisture puddles on the window frames and sills adding to the wood rot problem. He stated that it is so bad that they have to place towels on the inside sills to soak up the water daily.

Mr. Livingston stated that it was suggested in an earlier communication that they refurbish the existing wood windows and add storm windows to increase the efficiency of the windows. He stated that when he asked Staff for references that he was told that there is nobody whom he could check with locally to verify this method. He stated that Staff referred him to various websites with information on this method. He stated that the easiest of these websites to read gave an example of this method being done in Oakland, CA. He stated that he didn't feel that it was a good comparison with the differences in climates of California verses Texas.

Mr. Livingston stated that they had, on many occasions, tried to repair the dried out glazing material on the windows, and usually ended up breaking the glass and having to replace the glass and reglaze the windows. He stated that in his personal experience, there is no economically easy way to refurbish the 31 windows. He stated that the other three windows are the aluminum, trailer type that were installed when the back porch was enclosed and converted to a laundry room. He stated that the 34 windows that they are looking to use would

be virtually identical to those that are now in place, if viewed from the street. They would be the highest energy rated construction with clear; non-tinted or coated glass, with the grillwork in the top half between the panes of glass. The original exterior trim pieces and sills would be left intact thus maintaining the character of our home. He described and showed some additional photos of the windows on the house with the Board that were not included with the Staff Report.

Chairperson Brad McKissick asked if there were any public comments from the audience.

Christy Lane, 802 W. Hunt Street, McKinney, TX 75069, stated that she had served two terms on the Historic Preservation Advisory Board. She stated that she lives directly across the street from this property. She stated that she didn't have any concerns about the applicant changing the wood windows to vinyl windows. She stated that the applicant has a beautiful home and yard. She stated that she felt that whatever the applicant decides to do would only enhance the property.

There were no other comments, so on a motion by Vice Chairperson Susan Germann, seconded by Board Member Edna Brown, the Board voted 7-0 to close the Public Hearing.

Chairperson Brad McKissick asked if there were any other questions or comments from the Board.

Vice Chairperson Susan Germann stated that she lives in a home well over 100 years of age. She stated that they were able to have their wood windows repaired locally. She asked if the applicant was stating that they were not able to find someone locally to repair the wood windows. Some of the Board Members and Mr. Giersch stated that they had some references for local businesses that could rebuild and/or refurbish wood windows. Mr. Livingston stated that he works part-time at Home Depot. He stated that, in his research, it would be much more expensive to repair the 34 wood windows verses replacing them with the matching vinyl windows.

Board Member Bill Kent stated that he feels that the new vinyl windows will change the look and character of the home. He stated that he felt that there are companies that will build new wood windows that would actually match the

original windows in the house. He stated that he felt that the windows are the eyes of the house. Mr. Livingston stated that it would cost 3 to 4 times as much to do this.

Vice Chairperson Susan Germann stated that the windows are a distinctive feature of the house. She discussed the Secretary of the Interior's Standards sections that address windows.

Board Member Randy Hubbard asked the applicant how many of the windows have deteriorated to the point that they have to be replaced and how many just need repairing. Mr. Livingston stated that more than half are bowed and neglected.

Board Member Bob Smith asked the applicant if the moisture problems that they were having could be caused with the air conditioner not pulling the moisture out of the air. He stated that he had wood windows and did not have these issues. Mr. Livingston stated that their single-pane wood windows are having a lot of problems with sweating. He did not feel it was an air conditioning problem.

Chairperson Brad McKissick asked if there were any more questions or comments from the Board. There being none, on a motion by Vice Chairperson Susan Germann, seconded by Board Member Kimberly Smith, the Board voted 7-0 to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness application as submitted by the Applicant.

Mr. Guy Giersch discussed the applicant's options to appeal the Board's decision to City Council.

Chairperson McKissick continued with the Discussion Item.

Mr. Guy Giersch gave an update on the 2010-2011 Historic Home Recognition Program calendars. He stated that the calendars should be back from the printer by early next week. He stated that it's already time to start getting nominations for the next calendar. Copies of the nomination forms were distributed to the Board. Mr. Giersch expressed his gratitude towards Joseph Crisalli for his hard work on this year's calendar.

Mr. Kevin Spath discussed the purpose of the calendars. He asked the Board to read over the program details that are included in the Board's notebooks. He stated that it's the third year of the program. He stated that a lot

of people look forward to calendars each year. He mentioned that the calendar is going to be recognized at a City Council Meeting in November. He stated that the Board, homeowners of the fourteen featured homes, people who placed advertisements in the calendar, and everyone who helped with preparing the calendar would be invited to this meeting.

There being no further business, Chairperson Brad McKissick declared the meeting adjourned at 6:17 p.m.

Brad McKissick
CHAIRPERSON