

AGENDA ITEM

TO: Planning and Zoning Commission

THROUGH: Brandon Opiela, Senior Planner

FROM: Anthony Satarino, Planner

SUBJECT: Conduct a Public Hearing to Consider/Discuss/Act on the Request by Bob Tomes Ford, on Behalf of Zerga Investments I, Ltd., for Approval of a Meritorious Exception for Brandon Tomes Subaru Dealership, Approximately 2.26 Acres, Located on the Southwest Corner of North Brook Drive and U.S. Highway 75 (Central Expressway).

APPROVAL PROCESS: The Planning and Zoning Commission is the final approval authority for the proposed meritorious exception.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the proposed meritorious exception.

APPLICATION SUBMITTAL DATE: April, 2011 (Original Application)
May 9, 2011 (Revised Submittal)
May 13, 2011 (Revised Submittal)

ITEM SUMMARY: The applicant is requesting a meritorious exception to the Architectural and Site Standards section of the Zoning Ordinance for an automobile sales facility (Brandon Tomes Subaru). The applicant has indicated that the proposed elevations for the building complex display a modern style of architecture which is characterized by a composition of metal paneling, a glass curtain wall system and a parapet roof. In addition, in an effort to combine the modern style with traditional architectural styles, the applicant is proposing to use natural slate and neutral colored brick finishing materials. The applicant has submitted a material board and is available for the Commission to review.

The meritorious exception is being requested because the proposed architectural elevations:

- (1) Exceed the maximum percentage of allowed architectural metal finishing material on two of the elevations of the proposed building.

The applicant has an associated site plan (11-053SP) that is also being considered at the May 24, 2011 Planning and Zoning Commission meeting.

ZONING NOTIFICATION SIGNS: Section 41-233 of the City of McKinney Zoning Ordinance states that all zoning changes or amendments, including zoning, rezoning, amendments to Planned Developments, meritorious exceptions to the architectural standards, specific use permits and the like shall be required to post zoning change signs. The applicant has posted zoning notification signs on the subject property, as specified within Section 41-233 of the City of McKinney Zoning Ordinance.

COMPLIANCE WITH ARCHITECTURAL STANDARDS: The purpose of the architectural standards is to set minimum standards for the appearance of non-residential and multiple family buildings and corresponding site elements which are recognized as enhancing property values and are in the interest of the general welfare of the City of McKinney. Staff is of the opinion that the proposed architectural design of Brandon Tomes Subaru satisfies the intent of the architectural standards, through the use of building materials, colors, and façade design.

The provisions within the Architectural and Site Standards section of the Zoning Ordinance regarding meritorious exceptions states that “It is not the intent of this ordinance to discourage innovation. An architectural and site design that does not conform with the specific requirements of this ordinance, but which has merit by marking a positive contribution to the visual environment and which is appropriate to the site and use, may be submitted for consideration as a meritorious exception.” Staff is of the opinion that the proposed design satisfies the above provision by providing a positive architectural enhancement to the surrounding area.

The Architectural and Site Standards section of the Zoning Ordinance pertaining to granting a meritorious exception states that the Planning and Zoning Commission shall consider the following factors in determining the extent of any exception to be granted:

1. The extent to which the application meets other specific standards of this ordinance;
2. The extent to which the application meets the spirit and intent of this ordinance through the use of building materials, colors, and façade design to create a building of exceptional quality and appearance;
3. The positive or negative impact of the proposed project on surrounding property use and property values, in comparison to the expected impact of a project which could be built in conformance with the standards of this ordinance; and
4. The extent to which the proposed project accomplishes City goals.

MINIMUM POINT SCORE: Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) in the Zoning Ordinance requires a minimum point score of 85 points for non-residential uses in non-industrial districts in order for the architectural elevations to be approved by Staff.

The Architectural and Site Standards state that for all non-residential uses in non-industrial districts, at least 50 percent of each wall shall be covered with a masonry finishing material. Acceptable masonry finishing materials are brick, stone, or synthetic stone materials, including, but not limited to slate, flagstone, granite, limestone and marble. The applicant is proposing more than 80 percent of approved masonry finishing material on all elevations of the building.

The Architectural and Site Standards also require any remainder of exterior finishing materials to be stucco, EIFS, architectural concrete masonry units (CMU), concrete tilt wall construction, architectural metal finishing material (limited to 10 percent), or glass curtain wall systems for multi-story office and retail buildings. The applicant is proposing to utilize architectural metal finishing material on three of the four elevations, two of which exceed the maximum 10 percent. The applicant is proposing to use 21 percent of architectural metal finishing material on the northern elevation and 19 percent on the eastern elevation. It is important to note that other buildings in McKinney have been approved through the meritorious exception process which utilize similar metal paneling or metal accents, such as the DrPepper StarCenter, TRAXXAS Corporate Headquarters and McKinney Executive Suites.

The project earns points for other features, besides masonry, such as exterior color, roof treatment, building massing, minor façade offsets, doors and windows treatment, height slope standards and glass treatment. In total, the applicant has exceeded the minimum 85 point requirement, and has achieved 96 points per the submitted Non-industrial District Calculation Sheet (attached), but does not meet the ordinance due to the percentage of metal paneling proposed in the design. Staff feels the applicant has met the spirit and intent of the Architectural and Site Standards by creating a building of exceptional quality which can make a positive contribution to the surrounding visual environment

MERITORIOUS DESIGN: The intent of the Architectural and Site Standards section of the Zoning Ordinance is to set standards for the appearance of non-residential and multiple family buildings and corresponding site elements, which are recognized as enhancing property values and are in the interest of the general welfare of the City.

The applicant has described in the letter of intent the following building design characteristics:

“The ACM (aluminum composite material) paneling is widely accepted automotive “signature” look that many manufactures have incorporated to express and portray an attractive look of modernization; fresh, clean, sharp, and appealing.”

The applicant has indicated in the letter of intent that through the development of the subject property, they want to continue the “look” of the company’s other two existing buildings located on U.S. Highway 75 (Central Expressway) “so that all three buildings will express the same overall appearance to the passerby/onlooker.” It is important to

note; however, that the existing Bob Tomes Ford and Pre-Owned Super Center buildings along U.S. Highway 75 (Central Expressway) were constructed prior to the adoption of the Architectural and Site Standards of the Zoning Ordinance and subsequently were not required to meet the architectural standards when the facades of the buildings were recently remodeled to incorporate metal panel accents.

With that said, Staff feels that the applicant has pursued a design that is modern while using traditional finishing materials to create a unique blend of architectural styles. The use of metal paneling should not detract from the overall design and quality of the building, but should instead enhance the visual interest of the building through the use of contrasting materials and textures, making the request meritorious.

IMPACT ON EXISTING DEVELOPMENT: The land surrounding the subject property is mostly developed. Bob Tomes Ford is located to the north of the subject property and the Executive Suites, U-Store-It and a cellular tower are to the south and west. Movies 14 and Culvers Restaurant are to the east, across U.S. Highway 75 (Central Expressway). Staff believes the proposed design with metal paneling and a glass curtain wall system combined with traditional masonry finishing materials and other architectural elements, can have a positive impact on the surrounding visual environment, and is of the opinion that the proposed architectural design of the building is both innovative and of exceptional quality.

MISCELLANEOUS: A meritorious exception shall not be granted to serve as a convenience to the applicant or for reasons related to economic hardship. Staff believes that this is not the case with the proposed meritorious exception request.

OPPOSITION TO OR SUPPORT OF REQUEST: Staff has not received any comments either in opposition to or in support of this request.

ATTACHMENTS:

- Maps
- Letter of Intent
- Non-Industrial District Calculation Sheet
- Proposed Elevations
- PowerPoint Presentation

Action: