



CITY OF MCKINNEY, TEXAS

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #: 18-0094FR2 **Name:** McKinney Porsche Facade Plan Appeal
Type: Agenda Item **Status:** Approved
In control: City Council Regular Meeting
On agenda: 10/16/2018 **Final action:** 10/16/2018
Title: Conduct a Public Hearing to Consider/Discuss/Act on a Façade Plan Appeal for an Automobile Service and Repair Facility (Porsche McKinney), Located on the Northeast Corner of Hardin Boulevard and State Highway 121 (Sam Rayburn Tollway)

Indexes:

Attachments: 1. 081418 Minutes, 2. 082818 Minutes, 3. Location Map and Aerial Exhibit, 4. Letter of Intent, 5. Proposed Elevations, 6. Presentation

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
10/16/2018	1	City Council Regular Meeting	Approved Closing Public Hearing	Pass
10/16/2018	1	City Council Regular Meeting	Denied	Pass

Conduct a Public Hearing to Consider/Discuss/Act on a Façade Plan Appeal for an Automobile Service and Repair Facility (Porsche McKinney), Located on the Northeast Corner of Hardin Boulevard and State Highway 121 (Sam Rayburn Tollway)

COUNCIL GOAL: Direction for Strategic and Economic Growth
(1C: Provide a strong city economy by facilitating a balance between industrial, commercial, residential, and open space)

MEETING DATE: October 16, 2018

DEPARTMENT: Planning

CONTACT: Jennifer Arnold, AICP, Interim Director of Planning
Samantha Pickett, AICP, Planning Manager
Melissa Spriegel, AICP, Planner I

RECOMMENDED CITY COUNCIL ACTION: Staff recommends denial of the proposed façade plan appeal.

However, the applicant is requesting approval of the following variances which Staff cannot support:

1. The applicant receive approval of a variance to utilize metal as the primary finishing material.
2. The applicant receive approval of a variance to utilize corrugated (ribbed) metal as an allowed finishing material.

3. The applicant receive approval of a variance to waive the requirement for long, uninterrupted rooflines to be broken in to smaller segments.
4. The applicant receive approval of a variance to waive the requirement for parapet roof lines to feature a well-defined cornice treatment.
5. The applicant receive approval of a variance to waive the requirement for elevations visible from right-of-way (the north and west elevations) to share the same architectural features and design as the front building elevation.
6. The applicant receive approval of a variance to waive the offset requirements for all elevations.
7. The applicant receive approval of a variance to waive the requirement for the primary entrance to feature a protected entry.

APPLICATION SUBMITTAL DATE: June 18, 2018 (Original Application)
July 9, 2018 (Revised Submittal)
July 16, 2018 (Revised Submittal)

ITEM SUMMARY: The applicant is requesting a Façade Plan Appeal for an automobile service center (Porsche McKinney) located at the northeast corner of Hardin Boulevard and State Highway 121 (Sam Rayburn Tollway), due to the proposed elevations not conforming to the requirements of the City's Architectural Standards for non-residential uses in non-industrial districts.

The applicant has submitted the associated site plan (18-0094SP), which is being considered for approval concurrently with this façade plan appeal. The associated preliminary-final plat (18-0135PF) was approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission on June 27, 2018.

On August 14, 2018, The Planning and Zoning Commission voted 7-0-0 to continue the public hearing and table the item to the August 28, 2018 Planning and Zoning Commission Meeting.

On August 28, 2018, the Planning and Zoning Commission voted 7-0-0 to close the public hearing and table the item indefinitely.

Typically, façade plans can be approved by Staff; however, the applicant is requesting approval of a façade plan appeal, which is being considered by City Council concurrently with the site plan. The façade plan appeal is detailed further below.

COMPLIANCE WITH ARCHITECTURAL STANDARDS: The purpose of the architectural standards is to set minimum standards for the appearance of non-residential and multi-family buildings and corresponding site elements, which are recognized as enhancing property values and are in the interest of the general welfare of the City of McKinney. The standards are intended to serve as a baseline for the minimum design expectations of the City. These standards are not intended to prohibit architectural innovation nor are they intended to mandate specific architectural styles and concepts. Rather, they are intended to provide for development of enduring quality that provides visual character and interest.

Façade Plan Appeals state that the Planning and Zoning Commission shall consider the following

factors in determining the extent of any exception to be granted:

1. The extent to which the application meets other specific standards of this ordinance;
2. The extent to which the application meets the spirit and intent of this chapter through the use of building materials, colors, and façade design to create a building of exceptional quality and appearance;
3. The positive or negative impact of the proposed project on surrounding property use and property values, in comparison to the expected impact of a project which could be built in conformance with the standards of this ordinance;
4. The extent to which the proposed project accomplishes City goals as stated in the Comprehensive Plan or other approved documents; and
5. Convenience to the applicant and/or reasons related to economic hardship shall not be grounds for approval of an application.

The applicant has requested the following variances to the façade plan:

- Utilize metal as a primary finishing material.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that all elevations for buildings that are three stories or smaller in height shall be finished with at least 50 percent masonry finishing materials. The applicant is proposing 76-100% metal on all elevations. In the letter of intent, the applicant indicates that metal finishing material is being requested to remain consistent with the Porsche corporate image. It is Staff's professional opinion that a similar look could be achieved through the use of masonry materials, such as a darker colored brick or stone, or with a combination of primary and secondary materials. Given the high visibility of the property from two major thoroughfares, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.
- Utilize corrugated (ribbed) metal as an allowed finishing material.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that corrugated metal is not an allowed finishing material. The applicant is proposing to utilize 44% corrugated metal on the front and 100% corrugated metal on all other elevations. The use of corrugated metal is inconsistent with surrounding development, such as the MISD stadium immediately to the north, and is not in line with the desired design and character of McKinney defined through the utilization of masonry finishing materials. Additionally, although dark colored corrugated metal is utilized on Porsche dealerships in other cities, it is not utilized to the extent it is proposed on these elevations for the service center. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.
- Waive the requirement for long, uninterrupted rooflines to be broken in to smaller segments.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that

long uninterrupted roof lines and planes that are visible from the public right-of-way or are oriented toward properties zoned or used for residential purposes shall be broken into smaller segments through the use of changes in height, roof form, type or planes which typically correspond to offsets in the building's facade, or other appropriate architectural elements. The applicant is proposing a flat roof line with no variations. In the letter of intent, the applicant indicates this design is intended to convey the technical precision that the vehicles embody. It is Staff's professional opinion that the flat roofline, being consistent in height for the entire length of the building, will appear monotonous in its design and is more appropriate for not located on a highly visible property at a primary intersection. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.

- Waive the cornice treatment requirement.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that parapet roof lines shall feature a well-defined cornice treatment or another similar architectural element to visually cap each building elevation. This requirement is to provide depth and contrast to an otherwise flat roofline, creating visual interest. The applicant is proposing a flat roof line featuring no cornice treatment. It is Staff's professional opinion that the lack of a well-defined cornice treatment to cap the elevation creates an unfinished look, with no breakage in an otherwise flat, monotonous roof line. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.
- Waive the requirement for the north and west elevations to share the same architectural features and design as the front building elevation.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that all elevations of each building that are visible from the public right-of-way or are oriented towards properties zoned or used for residential purposes shall share the same architectural features and design as the front building elevation. The applicant is proposing 100% corrugated metal finishing material on both the north and west elevations oriented toward right-of-way. In the letter of intent the applicant indicates that this is done to maintain the focus for customers on the entry. However, as these elevations have direct frontage on two rights-of-way, Hardin Boulevard and Future Collin McKinney Parkway, and are highly visible, it is Staff's professional opinion that creating visual interest for those traveling on these roadways, visiting the site and adjacent sites, and for the existing residential homes in the area is essential. Furthermore, as the subject property is located on a major intersection along a main entrance into the city it is important to create meaningful, quality development that is visually interesting and entices people to visit the area. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.
- Waive the offset requirements from all elevations.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that at a minimum, elevations that are 50 feet or longer in horizontal length shall be interrupted by at least two offsets (projection or recess) from the primary facade plane of at least 18 inches in depth. The applicant is proposing one offset meeting the 18" depth requirement on all elevations; however, a second offset is not proposed on the

elevations. Staff has concerns with the lack of offsets, particularly on the front elevation which features overhead doors flush with the main building wall. The overhead doors are oriented toward State Highway 121 (Sam Rayburn Tollway) and, being on the same plane as the main building wall, are highly visible and become a focus of the front elevation. It is Staff's professional opinion that offsets could be utilized to enhance certain architectural features, such as the main glass entry feature, while detracting from the less visually appealing features, such as service entrances. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.

- Waive the requirement for the primary entrance to feature a protected entry.
 - Section 146-139 (Architectural and Site Standards) of the Zoning Ordinance states that the primary entrance for all buildings shall feature a protected entry, no smaller than three feet in depth, through the use of a recessed entry, porte-cochere, awning, canopy or similar architectural feature that serves the same purpose. The protected entry is required for the benefit and comfort of the customers; to shelter customers from the elements by providing an area to prepare for the weather before fully stepping outside. The applicant is proposing an open entry, flush with the main building elevation and with no type of covering. In the letter of intent the applicant indicates that a covering detracts from the appearance of the fully glazed entry piece. However, it is Staff's professional opinion that a protected entry can be provided without losing the desired look through features such as a recessed entry or an overhang created in conjunction with the proposed perforated metal feature. As such, Staff recommends denial of the proposed variance request.

IMPACT ON EXISTING DEVELOPMENT: It is Staff's professional opinion that the proposed design would have a negative impact on existing developments surrounding the subject property.

OPPOSITION TO OR SUPPORT OF REQUEST: Staff has received no comments in support of or in opposition to this request.